THE CITY OF ASHEVILLE

MEMORANDUM

To: City Council Members

Cc: Debra Campbell, City Manager

From: Budget Division Staff

Date: April 27, 2021

Subject: Responses to Questions from April 13 Budget Work Session

At the Budget work session held on April 13, 2021, City Council members posed several questions to staff regarding the current year's budget and plans for the proposed budget for Fiscal Year 2021-22. Answers to these questions are detailed in this memorandum.

Question: How much revenue has been lost citywide due to COVID-19?

Staff is awaiting guidance from the US Treasury Department to determine which revenues will be eligible to claim for reimbursement from the American Rescue Plan and what the limitations will be around how revenue loss should be calculated.

Question: Will religious organizations be eligible to receive ARPA funding as they were with PPP?

Religious organizations are still eligible to receive PPP funding under the new plan. No additional information is available on eligibility for other ARPA funding.

Question: Can ARPA funding be used toward water infrastructure to offset some of the needed rate adjustments? Can this be considered a loss of revenue?

While investment in water infrastructure is an eligible expense under ARPA, this is a one-time revenue source and will not eliminate the need for a permanent ongoing revenue stream to replace the Capital Improvement (CIP) fee revenue and maintain the water system's debt rating.

Question: How can City Boards & Commissions have more input in the budget process?

Boards and commissions are tasked with recommending policy to City Council. Staff support this work by identifying resources (new or existing) required to operationalize policy options. Often this results in requests for new resources during the budget process. This year's approach focused on a review of existing services and did not include a call for departmental requests to enhance or expand programs.

As part of efforts to enhance budget engagement in 2019, budget staff presented information about the budget process and top City Council priorities to all boards and commissions. Opportunities for engagement for this year, including six virtual community engagement

sessions and an online survey, were shared with all committee chairs via the City Clerk's Office. Staff hope to continue to expand engagement opportunities in next year's process, including for boards and commissions, as pandemic restrictions are eased.

Question: How many vacant positions does the City currently have?

See attached list.

Question: How are sanitation services currently funded, and what is the cost of recycling service?

Current year budget information is provided below. This does not include the cost of any administrative oversight provided by the Public Works Department, or indirect service provided by other departments.

FY21 Solid Waste Budget	
Revenues	
Sanitation Fees	$5,000,000
Expenditures	
Sanitation Division	$4,236,868
Recycling Contract	$1,298,311
Total Expenditures	**$5,535,179**

Question: Is there additional funding for body-worn camera (BWC) maintenance in the proposed budget for FY22? Are there alternative funding sources available?

APD will have a new contract with Axon for body-worn and fleet dashboard cameras that is anticipated to cost an additional $180,000. This contract includes maintenance for 195 BWCs, 133 fleet cameras, and interview room cameras. Costs associated with this contract include

- licensing and storage
- camera hardware, software maintenance, accessories
- training programs
- 24/7 support
- equipment refreshes and warranties

APD has utilized grant funding to purchase new equipment, but staff is not aware of grant funding for ongoing operation and maintenance costs. The first fleet dashboard camera system purchase in 2018 was funded with a 50/50 match grant from NC Governor's Crime Commission State Appropriation Committee ($56,950 grant). APD also used funds from a 2018 DOJ Justice Assistance Grant to purchase the initial Interview Room platform.

Question: How much would it cost to implement APD's Downtown District in today's dollars?

The chart below shows the components of the APD Downtown District and how those costs have changed since FY18. Please note that the Downtown District was funded for half of the fiscal year in FY18.

Item	**FY18 Cost (Full Year)**	**FY21 Cost**	**Difference**
12 Officers	$738,428	$777,710	$39,282
2 Sergeants	$163,490	$180,170	$16,680
1 Lieutenant	$99,287	$131,373	$32,086
Uniforms & Equipment (recurring costs only)	$41,250	$75,855	$34,605
Total	**$1,042,455**	**$1,165,108**	**$122,653**

Question: What would staffing cost for the new fire station be using the Class and Compensation Study's recommended pay plan?

Staff has not made final recommendations on compensation structure or changes. The information provided below is based on the Fire Pay Plan proposed by the Archer Company.

	FY21 Training & Partial Year Estimated Salary & Benefits		Ongoing Annual Cost Estimated Salary & Benefits	
Title (# of positions)	Current Plan	Archer Proposal	Current Plan	Archer Proposal
Firefighter (9)	$ 30,934	$ 34,708	$ 46,330	$ 62,555
Engineer (3)	$ 33,686	$ 35,389	$ 58,163	$ 65,483
Lieutenant (3)	$ 36,387	$ 37,438	$ 69,776	$ 74,294
Total*	**$ 488,623**	**$ 583,245**	**$ 800,786**	**$ 982,330**
Difference		$ 94,622		$ 181,544

*This total does not include any one-time or ongoing operational costs for the building itself or additional services that will be provided.

Question: What does AFD's SAFER grant fund, how has the City's share of SAFER Grant costs changed over time, and what are the city's future obligations?

The Staffing for Adequate Fire and Emergency Response (SAFER) grant, funded through the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA), is intended to enhance local fire departments' abilities to comply with staffing, response and operational standards established by the National Fire Protection Association. The City has been awarded two SAFER grants, one

in 2018 for nine positions and another in 2019 for six positions. Grant funding is provided to cover the cost of these positions as follows:

- Year 1: 75% grant/25% match
- Year 2: 75% grant/25% match
- Year 3: 35% grant/65% match

The 2018 grant is currently in its final year and ends during next fiscal year (November 2021), and the 2019 grant is currently in year two of three ending in FY 2022-23 (November 2022). The grants do not require the City to maintain the higher level of staffing after year three.

Question: How have City water rates and Municipal Sewerage District (MSD) rates changed over the last ten years?

A table showing these rates is attached.

City of Asheville Vacancies

The following positions are vacant as of April 21, 2021. Some of these positions are currently filled on an interim basis or expected to be filled permanently in the coming weeks.

Department	Division	Position	Vacancies
Capital Projects		Project Manager	2
		Construction Inspector	1
		Program Manager CP - P Rec	1
		Program Manager CP - Transpo	1
	CP TOTAL:		***5***
Comm. & Econ. Dev.	Econ. Dev.	Real Estate Manager	1
		Department Director	1
		Economic Development Specialist	1
	HCCA	Labor Crew Leader	1
		Labor Crew Supervisor	1
		Laborer	2
	CED TOTAL:		***7***
City Manager's Office	Equity & Inclusion	Equity Inclusion Director	1
		Training Consultant	1
		Human Relations Specialist	1
	CMO	Executive Assistant	1
	CMO TOTAL:		***4***
Communications & Public Engagement		Communication Specialist	1
	CAPE TOTAL:		***1***
DSD		Building Plan Reviewer	1
		Code Enforcement Officer I	3
		Zoning Enforcement Officer	1
	DSD TOTAL:		***5***
Finance		Fiscal Technician	1
		Accountant III	1
		Assistant Director	1
		Safety Admin	1
		Safety Officer	1
	FINANCE TOTAL:		***5***
Fire		Administrative Assistant	1
(Not including AFD locs 111 and 112)	***FIRE TOTAL:***		***1***

City of Asheville Vacancies

The following positions are vacant as of April 21, 2021. Some of these positions are currently filled on an interim basis or expected to be filled permanently in the coming weeks.

Department	Division	Position	Vacancies
Human Resources		HR Manager- Emp Eng	1
	HR TOTAL:		***1***
Information Tech. Svcs.		Senior Software Engineer	1
		Tech Support Technician	1
	ITS TOTAL:		***2***
Parks and Recreation		Community Outreach Specialist Sr	1
		Assistant Director	1
		Equipment Operator	1
		Labor Crew Coordinator	2
		Labor Crew Leader	1
		Park Warden 30 hrs	0.875
		Focus Area Mgr	1
		Asset Manager	1
		Athletic Director	1
		Program Leader 25 hrs	0.75
		Program Manager	1
		Recreation Facility Supervisor	3
	P&R TOTAL		***14.625***
Planning & Urban Design		Planning Technician	1
		Urban Planner I	1
		Urban Designer I	1
	PUD TOTAL:		***3***
Police		Administrative Assistant	1
		Evidence & Property Room Tech	1
		Police Captain	1
		Sworn Police Officers (PO/SPO)	67
		Police Sergeant	1
		Senior Office Assistant	1
		Telecommunicator	2
		Telecommunicator Shift Supervisor	1
	APD TOTAL:		***75***
Public Works	Administration	Financial Business Mgr	1
	Fleet	Auto Mechanic	1

City of Asheville Vacancies

The following positions are vacant as of April 21, 2021. Some of these positions are currently filled on an interim basis or expected to be filled permanently in the coming weeks.

Department	Division	Position	Vacancies
		Administrative Assistant	1
		Heavy Equip Supervisor	1
	Sanitation	Inventory Specialist	1
		Area Supervisor- Enf Officer	1
		Equipment Operator	3
		Senior Equipment Operator	2
	Asset Management	Asset Manager	1
	Stormwater	Equipment Operator	1
		Labor Crew Supervisor	2
		Senior Equipment Operator	3
		Stormwater Division Mgr	1
	Streets	Administrative Assistant	1
		Equipment Operator	3
		Groundworker	2
		Tree Trimmer	1
	PW TOTAL:		***26***
Transportation		Facility Attendant .75	0.75
		Facility Attendant	2
		Traffic Engineer	1
		Transit Financial Grants Analyst	1
	TRANSPORTATION TOTAL:		***4.75***
Water Resources		Customer Service Rep	1
		Water Maintenance Worker I	3
		Assistant Director	1
		Business Services Specialist III	1
		Administrative Assistant	1
		Construction Inspector	1
		Lab Supervisor	1
		Water Plant Operator	5
	WATER TOTAL:		***14***

City of Asheville Water Rates & Metropolitan Sewerage District Rates for Residential Users, 2011-2021											
	2011-12	**2012-13**	**2013-14**	**2014-15**	**2015-16**	**2016-17**	**2017-18**	**2018-19**	**2019-20**	**2020-21**	**2021-22**
City of Asheville Water Rates											
Rate (per CCF)	$3.77	$3.77	$3.81	$3.87	$3.93	$3.99	$4.05	$4.13	$4.21	$4.21	$4.47
Base Fee	$6.00	$6.00	$6.00	$6.00	$6.00	$6.00	$6.00	$6.21	$6.34	$6.34	$9.78
CIP Fee	$7.64	$7.64	$7.72	$7.84	$7.94	$8.06	$8.18	$8.34	$8.52	$0.00	$0.00
MSD Rates											
Treatment Rate (per CCF)	$3.88	$3.98	$4.08	$4.18	$4.28	$4.39	$4.50	$4.61	$4.73	$4.73	
Billing Charge	$2.14	$2.21	$2.25	$2.29	$2.30	$2.31	$2.36	$2.40	$2.45	$2.45	